



HISTORIC
ENVIRONMENT
SCOTLAND

ÀRAINNEACHD
EACHDRAIDHEIL
ALBA

Property in Care (PIC) ID:PIC013

Designations: Scheduled Monument (SM90043)

Conservation Area (CA242)

Taken into State care: 1973 (Ownership)

Last reviewed: 2017

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

BROUGHTY CASTLE



We continually revise our Statements of Significance, so they may vary in length, format and level of detail. While every effort is made to keep them up to date, they should not be considered a definitive or final assessment of our properties.



© Historic Environment Scotland 2020

You may re-use this information (excluding logos and images) free of charge in any format or medium, under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 except where otherwise stated.

To view this licence, visit <http://nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3/>

or write to the Information Policy Team, The National Archives, Kew, London TW9 4DU, or email: psi@nationalarchives.gov.uk

Where we have identified any third party copyright information you will need to obtain permission from the copyright holders concerned.

Any enquiries regarding this document should be sent to us at:

Historic Environment Scotland

Longmore House

Salisbury Place

Edinburgh

EH9 1SH

+44 (0) 131 668 8600

www.historicenvironment.scot

You can download this publication from our website at

www.historicenvironment.scot

HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT SCOTLAND STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

BROUGHTY CASTLE

CONTENTS

1	Summary	2
1.1	Introduction	2
1.2	Statement of significance	2
2	Assessment of values	3
2.1	Background	3
2.2	Evidential values	6
2.3	Historical values	7
2.4	Architectural and artistic values	9
2.5	Landscape and aesthetic values	12
2.6	Natural heritage values	13
2.7	Contemporary/use values	13
3	Major gaps in understanding	14
4	Associated properties	15
5	Keywords	15
	Bibliography	15
	APPENDICES	
	Appendix 1: Timeline	16
	Appendix 2: A contribution on the 19 th - and 20 th -century defences of Broughty Castle (not included)	22

1 Summary

1.1 Introduction

Broughty Castle is an imposing stronghold situated on a promontory at the mouth of the Tay estuary, unusually combining elements of medieval and Victorian military architecture. Its history reflects several turbulent episodes in Scotland's last 500 years of history and encapsulates the story of the defence of the Tay estuary.

The stronghold is cared for by Historic Environment Scotland (HES). It was taken into State Ownership in 1973, though the Ministry of Works (HES predecessor) had involvement with the castle as early as 1910. For the last 50 years it has housed a museum. Broughty Castle Museum is run by Leisure and Culture Dundee on behalf of Dundee City Council. Note that the museum does not form part of this statement.

The Castle grounds are open to the public during the museum opening hours. Visitor numbers to the Castle in 2017 were 45,166.



Aerial view of Broughty Castle DP 045364 - © Crown Copyright: HES.

1.2 Statement of significance

Broughty Castle is unusual among lesser tower houses in its continued fortification and adaptation to different military requirements over almost 500 years. It shares some of this history with much more imposing military

strongholds such as Edinburgh, Stirling and Dumbarton Castles though at Broughty the aspect of coastal defence is the most significant. Some key aspects to its significance are:

- Broughty's role in the Anglo-Scottish conflict known as the War of the Rough Wooing when, during the 1540s, it became one of the Tudor monarchy's two key strongholds in their unsuccessful attempt to conquer Scotland, the other was Haddington.
- Broughty's post 1860 structures offer the best-preserved Scottish example of smaller scale coastal defences. The surviving elements of the anti-submarine station being especially important as the sole surviving remains of a Royal Marine Submarine Mining barracks in Scotland (those for the Forth (Port Laing) and Clyde (Fort Matilda) having been demolished).
- Its association with some significant historical figures such as the "Red Douglas" Earls of Angus and the Lords Gray of Fowlis. Broughty is also notable as famous architect Sir Robert Rowand Anderson's first known commission.
- The nineteenth century restoration and refortification of the castle is interesting both for Anderson's determination to retain the character of the old tower and the rapid redevelopments of the site in response to successive changes in military tactics.
- Broughty has an undoubted landmark quality, sited on a rocky promontory offering spectacular views from the tower and from the gun emplacements. The underground batteries offer a unique and exciting visitor experience, though this is only available by special arrangement e.g. Doors Open Day.
- Broughty Castle is run as a museum by Leisure & Culture Dundee. It houses displays on the social, cultural and natural history of Broughty Ferry, showcases the role of the Castle in Britain's coastal defences and provides a popular vantage point to view Broughty Ferry beach and the Tay estuary.

The bullet points above outline the main aspects of significance at Broughty Castle. The following Assessment section addresses the wider range of values which all contribute to the significance of Broughty Castle. At Appendix 1 there is a timeline and at Appendix 2 a more detailed assessment of the 19th and 20th century military defences.

2 Assessment of values

2.1 Background

The exact origins of Broughty Castle are unclear, but the site is certainly an ancient one. It is sometimes said to have been known as Partencraig, 'crab rock', although this appears to be a relatively modern reinterpretation of

“Portincraig”, the medieval name for the adjacent harbour and associated fishing village (Gaelic *port na creige*, “the port at the Crag”); “the Crag” is the early name for the rock, documented in the twelfth century. The name Broughty, plausibly interpreted as meaning ‘strong point on the Tay’, suggests an early fortified site from the Iron Age or early historic period.

In the twelfth century, the Crag formed a landmark within a local area of territory controlled by the Earls of Angus, when the adjacent harbour was already established as a fishing port and the home of a ferry across the Tay to Fife. As well as entitling the earls to revenues from the ferry tolls and fishing profits, it probably held some symbolic significance for them. In 1389, it seems to have been specifically retained by Margaret Countess of Angus when she transferred the earldom to her son, and in 1455, is described as the earldom’s “principal messuage” or symbolic seat of government. These references suggest that it may have already been the site of some sort of élite residence, though in another document of 1455 James II grants the Earl of Angus permission to build a castle on the Crag, as if for the first time. Documents of this sort were sometimes used to tacitly acknowledge the existence of existing castles. Reference to the “fortress of Broughty” in 1466 suggests that its fortifications were by then largely complete.

Conversely, when King James IV transferred Broughty Crag to Lord Gray of Fowls in 1490, he provided him with *another* license to build a castle there. It is unclear what to make of these conflicting documents, but as a datestone reading 1496 is said to have once stood near the top of the tower (Cumming 1843, p. 41) and a document of 1514 makes a reference to the “new fortress of Broughty”, one plausible interpretation is that the 4th Earl of Angus strengthened the defences of an existing residence, while Lord Gray then constructed the tower around 1500.

Regardless of its exact origins, the castle served to control the entrance to the Tay, and thus to guard Dundee and Perth from English raiders, but although it figures in the sources principally as a military strongpoint, its simultaneous potential as a lordly residence and a symbolic focus of authority (particularly the Crag) should not be overlooked.

Broughty Castle assumed its most prominent role in the War of the Rough Wooing, when it was occupied by an English garrison in 1547. After the expulsion of the English in 1550, it briefly housed a French garrison, and then control passed firmly to the Lords Gray, who used it as a residence, eventually making it their principal seat in the first half of the seventeenth century. The castle also contained a shore base for the Broughty Ferry fishery, with a document of 1601 showing that this incorporated two of the round towers and a vaulted “fish house” for preparing cured salmon. As late as the 1820s, the vaulted basements of the tower were apparently still used as the shore base of the fishery. In 1651, towards the end of the Civil War, the castle underwent a cursory siege by Roundhead forces, and was sold by the 8th Lord Gray in 1660s. It subsequently seems to have fallen into ruin.

In 1854, it was decided to rebuild the castle as a modern artillery fort defending the Tay with its garrison facilities being progressively adapted to accommodate more modern artillery and maritime defences such as minefields. This period saw the main tower modified to act as a barracks and arsenal, and its surrounding curtain wall rebuilt almost beyond recognition by the addition of ramparts designed to hold modern coast-defence guns.

The main phases of works were in the 1860s and the 1880s when the focus for defences shifted to submarine attack; a depot for submarine miners was constructed in 1888 to the north-west of the site and is still extant. The Forth and Tay were the final group of home ports to be defended by mines as part of this late 19th century phase of strategic coastal defence. Over subsequent decades the use of mines was successively abandoned and re-established as defence strategy changed. It is not certain if anti-submarine mining was undertaken in the Tay in WW1, though it certainly formed a key part of pre-WW1 defences and was re-established during WW2.

Even in its modified form and continued military usage, Broughty Castle retained its medieval Scottish appearance of a tall tower house surrounded by a low fortified barmkin. Its value as an ancient monument was recognised by Ministry of Works involvement in the site as early as 1910.

After WW2 the castle reverted to the Ministry of Works as surplus to military needs, and day-to-day management was passed to the City of Dundee Council, leading to the creation of a tea room within the castle in 1949, precursor of the current refreshment area, and the opening of the museum in 1969.

Since 1969, the Castle displays have been drawn from Dundee City Council's permanent collections. Each floor focussed on a different theme from Dundee's role in the whaling industry to the buildings military history.

Over the last 25 years displays have focussed on:

- Broughty Life: investigating the life of the area from prehistory to the present day.
- The Orchar Collection: showcasing highlights of the private art collection of nineteenth century industrialist and Broughty Ferry Provost, James Guthrie Orchar
- Broughty Life on Land: exploring the landscape and wildlife of the area
- The Armoury Gallery: articulating the Castle's role in Britain's coastal defences and the local volunteer force.
- The Observation Room: a viewpoint to enjoy the stunning Tay estuary and its wildlife.



Aerial view showing Broughty Castle and grounds in 1947. SC 910888 - © HES (RAF National Survey (Air Photographs), 1944-1950 Collection).

2.2 Evidential values

The evidential value of Broughty Castle relates primarily to the physical fabric of the site which evidences its long history of usage and development as a stronghold. Given the succession of fortifications on the site it is certain that below ground remains will survive from medieval or later fortification.

Therefore, any significant ground disturbance should be routinely monitored. Castle Green is also of high archaeological interest. The former existence of an icehouse, together with various military remains, may well survive. Here too any significant ground disturbance should be routinely monitored.

Early discoveries

Finds discovered during the later 1850s included ordnance and other military hardware, but it is said that these have since been lost. One significant find, the detachable breech chamber of a wrought-iron breech-loading cannon of sixteenth-century type, with a 1.8 inch (42mm) calibre, is safely held in the

National Museum of Scotland collection (LH 212). Three stone cannonballs found at the castle are now on display in the castle museum.

The castle itself

In terms of the castle itself, the tower retains the flavour of its 15th century origin, but of course the expected barmkin and ancillary buildings were altered or totally lost in subsequent developments. With that proviso, analysis of the standing building, together with documentary and pictorial information, has potential to add to our knowledge of its development.

Wider scheduled area

Modern below ground archaeological work has been carried out which supports the site's evidential potential, backed by the extensive documentation for its later history. The post 1860 work means that some of the earlier archaeology will have been disturbed or destroyed, but the later fortification is interesting in itself and some earlier elements do survive. In 1993 a watching brief in the courtyard revealed a substantial 2m wide wall running north-east to south-west, perhaps representing the remains of a mid-16th century angled tower, as well as evidence for frequent resurfacing of the courtyard. In 2008 a geophysical survey was undertaken to investigate subsidence on the Castle Green. This was known to have been the site of ancillary buildings associated with the later military history of the castle. The results indicated the survival of building remains across the site, including areas of general clearance, robbed wall and in-situ foundations.

Importance of the post 1860 resource

The modern (post 1860) fortifications represent an overlay of development phases which existing documentary sources, along with modern research, help to interpret. This increases the value of the resource and there is scope for further study. The value of the Broughty Castle complex lies in the state of preservation of what was, to a great extent, a purpose-built Victorian coast defence structure for a lower-ranked commercial port. The Clyde (as a commercial and shipbuilding port) and the Forth (as a major commercial port and then also a major naval base) were defended to a far greater extent. Of the middle-ranking commercial ports in Britain, only the Tay and Aberdeen in Scotland merited defence.

The evidence relating to the submarine miners' station is particularly valuable as it is the only Scottish example. Recording and analysis of the Barracks building would capture further evidence to determine how its arrangements have changed, and what may have survived from earlier phases of use. This could realise more of the evidential value of the site as no other submarine mining buildings survive in Scotland.

2.3 Historical values

Broughty Castle has a complex range of historical values, due to the juxtaposition of its two contrasting roles as medieval tower house and post-1860 fortification. A further association is with its "crag", the harbour and

fishing industry which seems to have formed part of its history since earliest records.

The following paragraphs pick out some key associations and events in the history of Broughty Castle.

Role in the Rough Wooing

Broughty Castle assumed perhaps its most prominent historical role during the War of the Rough Wooing. It was occupied by an English garrison in 1547, and along with Haddington it became one of the Tudor monarchy's two key strongholds in their unsuccessful attempt to conquer Scotland. After the expulsion of the English in 1550, it briefly housed a French garrison, and subsequently passed back and forth between Scottish political factions. In the 1570s control passed firmly to the Lords Gray, who used it as a residence, eventually making it their principal seat in the first half of the seventeenth century.

Broughty Castle also has a certain significance in religious history in relation to the Rough Wooing which was as much an ideological battle between Catholic and Protestant as it was a political one between Scotland and England. The continued adherence of the Grays to Catholicism after the Protestant Reformation (1560) also gives it a place within the history of recusant spirituality in Scotland. Jesuit missionaries are known to have come to the place in 1589, and probably frequented it with some regularity. The original castle may well have housed a chapel, perhaps as at **Affleck Castle** in an upper chamber of the main tower, although it is possible that in the post-Reformation period it was given the sort of more complex arrangements known in other recusant castles, where an architecturally impressive social space such as the entrance corridor or the great hall was adapted to double as a clandestine chapel.

In chronological terms, the "Rough Wooing" is just one brief interlude in the castle's medieval history, as a feudal stronghold in Scottish hands, which spans the period from at least the 1450s to the 1660s. But for much of this longer period, there is relatively little evidence for how Broughty Castle was used by its owners, and what evidence there is poses problems of interpretation.

Association with "Red" Douglasses and the Gray family

Broughty Castle is associated with two high-ranking dynasties from medieval Scotland, who were successively its lords ; the "Red Douglas" Earls of Angus (also lords of **Tantallon Castle** and **Bothwell Castle**, and ancestors of the Dukes of Hamilton) and the Lords Gray of Fowlis, a prominent local noble family. As chiefs of the Douglas and Gray clans, these historical figures play a role in defining the identity of those who bear their surnames, both in Scotland and the international Scottish diaspora.

1860 - 1945 military and social history

The restoration of the castle and its conversion into a military redoubt in the 1860s added a new chapter to its history, although it did not play a significant role in military action. The value of Broughty Castle lies in its capacity to illustrate a period and scale of coastal defence, very different from the major complexes in Clyde, Forth and at Scapa Flow. Aberdeen saw the construction and later adaptation of a fort (Torry Battery) to provide up-to-date defence; the Tay differed only in the adaptation of an earlier structure. Both saw similar levels of defence in place in the First and Second World Wars (with a second 6 inch battery established at both ports). Broughty Castle is in a better state of preservation than Torry Battery, with a consequently greater capacity to tell the story.

The site also houses the human stories of successive garrison and training units through the Victorian and Edwardian periods (where the story of volunteer units is particularly strong), and the conflicts of 1914-18 and 1939-45. During WW2, as well as British Army and Home Guard Units Broughty was staffed by the Polish Army, which adds an international dimension to its social history.

Local history – Crag, harbour and fishing

The significance of the place name and association with the Crag is given at 2.1. The successive lords of the castle obviously valued the image of status, nobility and ancient lineage associated with the Crag, which finds parallel in many Scottish castles built on prominent, dramatic natural rock outcrops or promontories.

Another, more unexpected aspect of Broughty Castle's history is its close association with the local fishing industry based in the adjacent harbour, the lord of the castle had proprietorial rights over the business, and documents of both 1601 and 1822 refer to buildings within the castle being used as a shore base for the fishery. The history of the fishery and the foreshore is already covered by the local museum within the castle's tower, but this direct connection is relatively unknown.

2.4 Architectural and artistic values

The architectural and design values of Broughty Castle principally settle around the original medieval tower house, the Rowand Anderson adaptation and restoration, and the outerworks, batteries and anti-submarine Barracks.

The early tower house

From available evidence, the medieval castle comprised a rectangular main tower sited at the north-west corner of a walled quadrangular courtyard, with an entrance gate in the west curtain, immediately adjacent to the tower. There was a smaller round tower at the north-east corner (in which the Royal Engineers found a gun in 1856), and some sort of tower or turret in the south-west corner (both towers are depicted on early 19th-century paintings, including Alexander Smith's painting c.1835, 'Beach Crescent and Broughty Castle', on display in the castle museum. MacGibbon and Ross, writing around 1890 but recording their recollections of the castle as it was before

1860, assert that there were recognisable remains of “three round towers” on the curtain wall, and that the interior courtyard was “completely buried in ruins covered in turf” (MacGibbon and Ross 1887-1892, iv. 386). Everything other than the main tower, entrance gate and stretch of west curtain has gone.

The main tower as originally built was rectangular and entered at ground level, apparently through two doorways, one on the east side, the other on the south. It had two vaulted rooms on the ground floor, three upper floors with wall chambers, and an attic. The ground floor has gun-holes, some of the inverted keyhole type dated to the mid-to-later 1400s. Due to the extent of the 1860/1 remodelling, the details of the tower's internal arrangement must remain in doubt, but its basic layout is clear, and although the battlements of the wall-head defences are a Victorian recreation, the projecting roof corbels are largely original and the arrangement of windows and turrets is broadly corroborated by illustrations predating the Victorian restoration, showing that the current layout faithfully reproduces at least the outline of the original design, with a cap-house rising sheer through the wall-head at one corner, and the rest of the roofline wrapped by a corbelled battlement with small projecting turrets at the other corners and the centre of each wall. Overall, this is an arrangement similar to that at nearby **Affleck Castle**.

The medieval entrance gate is round-arched and roll-moulded. The north-west angle and most of the west curtain also survives, albeit much repaired and rebuilt by Anderson. The south end of the west curtain was buried in earthwork of the 1890s rearmament. The north curtain, although heavily rebuilt around a Victorian gateway, drawbridge and gunloops, seems to follow the original wall line, and the round, recessed mountings of the gun emplacements at either end of the Victorian artillery rampart mimic the position and profile of the smaller north-east and south-west towers.

Although there is a tendency to emphasise the discontinuity between the two contrasting phases of Broughty's defences, it should be emphasised that the castle was an artillery fortress even in its medieval guise. The basement gunloops are of a style associated with the fifteenth century, showing that the tower was intended to be defended by artillery from the outset. Unfortunately, documents do not indicate how it was armed during the Tudor occupation of 1547-50, with only a listing of handguns and longbows being known, along with references to the garrison infantry and their victuals. However, during the 1860s, the breech-chamber of a wrought-iron gun of sixteenth-century type was recovered from the north-east tower, and from its calibre, 1.8 inches (42mm), it can be noted that it corresponds with the smallest calibre of stone round shot associated with the early Scottish artillery defences of c. 1450 at Threave, and also fall within the size range of the swivel-mounted guns called “bases” used in the Tudor navy, a number of which have been recovered from the *Mary Rose*. Subsequently, in 1572, the Regent Mar expected to obtain two “battering pieces” from Broughty for his siege of Edinburgh, the same number as he expected from the great royal fortresses of Dumbarton and Stirling, and in 1651, the castle was defended by four cannons. In both cases, the reference is probably to bronze or cast-iron artillery of medium or heavy

calibre, suggesting that Broughty Castle was well-armed by Scottish standards.

1860 restoration and adaptation

The 1860/1 refortification was designed by the 26-year-old Robert Rowand Anderson (1834-1921), then serving as a civilian with the Corps of Royal Engineers. Broughty was his first architectural commission; he designed the 78th Highlanders memorial on **Edinburgh Castle's** Esplanade in the same year. Anderson went on to become Scotland's leading Victorian/Edwardian architect, his works including the National Portrait Gallery and National Museum of Antiquities, in Edinburgh. (He was also involved with the restoration of other HES properties, including **Jedburgh Abbey** and **St Bride's, Douglas**). He was knighted in 1902 and awarded the RIBA Gold Medal in 1916. Unfortunately, his working drawings for Broughty do not appear to have survived, but we must assume that his refurbishment of the ruined main tower preserved the integrity of the original structure.

Anderson's work produced an interesting architectural curiosity. The limitations of an exposed and restricted site, combined with Anderson's determination to reuse the ruined main tower and enclosing wall, produced a strange marriage of new military engineering work and an essay in historical architecture. Its most obvious parallels lie nearly 200 years earlier in the work of the famous French siege engineer Vauban (1633-1707), who had favoured keep-like towers as observation positions for coastal artillery (Cabaret, Tatihou, St-Vaast-la-Hougue), and shown a willingness to retain historically significant castle architecture (Citadelle de Blaye, where the gatehouse and curtain wall of a thirteenth-century castle are built into the rampart-line of a star fort). The 1860/1 works increased the tower in size by the addition of a wing at the north-west corner, for use as barracks; the tower's vaulted ground floor became the magazine.

The entirely new artillery fortification added to its south and east comprised a massively thick earthen terreplein externally faced in stone. Two 68-pounder guns were placed along the west curtain to engage ships in the river; two 10-inch guns covered the channel and three more faced the approach from the open sea.¹ A guardhouse was built east of the tower (later demolished) to control the new drawbridge entrance through the north curtain, loopholed for musketry. The drawbridge still retains its lifting mechanism, one of only two surviving in Scotland (the other is at **Blackness Castle**, also built in the 1860s). A caponier (gun gallery) was built out from the battery's south-east corner, and accessed from the courtyard along a tunnel, to cover the adjacent lengths of walling. An enclosure, also loopholed for musketry, was constructed beyond the west curtain to cover the harbour in case of land attack; it is described as the site of "now-demolished buildings, probably including the hospital" (Mudie et. al. 1973 p. 73), which has been generally taken to mean that it housed the garrison hospital, though it may in fact refer

¹For further details on the armaments at Broughty Castle see Dr. Gordon Barclay's report at Appendix 2 and report by Atkinson (2005, Headland Archaeology)

to the supposed location of the twelfth-century hospice for travellers using the ferry route to Fife.

Reactions to Anderson's design

Anderson's design has generally been regarded as more of a curiosity than an effective fortification, but it should be noted that when Broughty Castle was refortified, the ironclad warship was only just entering service, and the principal threat was still from wooden-hulled ships of the line, which would be utterly helpless against the explosive ammunition of its 10-inch shell guns, while the fast current prevented close-range attacks by armoured floating batteries, and its own ramparts provided a good protection against bombardment by either shell or round shot. It was only in subsequent decades, with the rapid development of "steam and steel" warships and the increasing range and firepower of their new breech-loading guns, that it came to be seen as dangerously obsolete.

However, in 1887 a list of recommended improvements had been made by the Stanhope Committee report of 1887, based on a list of shortcomings highlighted by the Joint Committee of the Royal Artillery and Royal Engineers. This was part of a wider upgrading of the coastal defence of the UK. Thus by 1888, Captain J.G. Grant of the Forfarshire Artillery Volunteers could condemn it as ; *'badly built, badly designed and utterly useless for the purpose [...] A fort such as this could never defend our river, for its demolition would only afford an enemy an hour's pleasant and agreeable recreation!*' Following Captain Grant's diatribe, amendments were carried out to the artillery defences. These included constructing two new gun emplacements with concrete aprons along the south curtain, so effectively burying the 1860/1 emplacements, and infilling the west enclosure to create additional magazines. Subsequent minor alterations included cutting a horizontal slit into the 1860/1 caponier in WWI for a Maxim gun to rake the beach to the east and building a Position Finding Cell on top of the main tower in WWI and a Battery and Fire Command Post on top of the main tower in WWII.

2.5 Landscape and aesthetic values

Broughty Castle manages to be both austere and attractive. The verticality of the main tower contrasts with the relative squatness of the surrounding artillery works, creating an interesting ensemble. The relative completeness of the castle, together with its landscaped courtyard and intriguing gun emplacements, all add to its attractiveness, the combination serving to offset the rather utilitarian aspects of the structures.

The surrounding Castle Green provides an attractive open area of green space to complement the brooding castle stonework. The harbours to the west, the beach to the east, and the waters of the Tay, serve as a blanket setting to the castle when approaching from the town. The castle is highly visible from along the Tay as well as from the Fife coast across the estuary.

The castle's relationship to its natural landscape is most obvious from the east beach, where it feels fittingly like a sea fortress, and from the Tay, where, depending on the light, it makes an attractive reflection across the rippling waters. This was the vista chosen by William Daniell, RA, for his aquatint published in *A Voyage around Great Britain* (1822).

The views out from the castle, particularly from the WWII defence post atop the main tower, are stunning, furnishing broad panoramas westward to the Tay bridges and Dundee Law, southward across the estuary to the north Fife coast and the low-lying tree-girt sands of Tentsmuir Point, and eastward to Buddon Ness lighthouse and the open North Sea.

The effect of the setting is to enhance somewhat the attractiveness of the property, as well as its uniqueness. Its sense of place is of an attractive, meaningful monument, with somewhat utilitarian or foreboding walls overcome by its prettiness and location.

2.6 Natural heritage values

The castle is close to the Monifeith Bay SSSI (Site of Special Scientific Interest) which is designated because of its Inter-tidal habitat and feeding area for internationally important numbers of wintering waders and ducks.

Bottle-nosed dolphins can frequently be sighted from the castle and are amongst the largest bottle-nosed dolphins in the world, needing extra blubber because of the low North Sea temperatures. They probably fatten from the salmon as they return to the Tay.

Of the plants growing around the castle, it is worth noting the presence of Sea Beat (*Beta vulgaris ssp maritima*) and Sea Plantain (*plantago maritime*) which are rare in Scotland.

2.7 Contemporary/use values

Broughty Castle occupies an important place in the hearts of local people, not least because of its long-standing function as a local museum and community facility, managed by the City of Dundee Council. As such it is fully integrated into the local scene. The castle easily captures popular imagination because of its connections with the Volunteers in the 19th century and its use in both World Wars. For example, a memorial seat was installed in 1969 to the memory of the Royal Artillery Territorials and Volunteers.

The museum and castle grounds are open all year round and popular with locals and visitors alike. The museum, rather than the castle itself, is undoubtedly the main draw. As well as its local history displays, the venue has a wide-ranging potential, and is used for theatre performances, public talks and art exhibitions. The Orchar Collection of paintings has been placed on permanent display, assembled by James Guthrie Orchar (1825-98), a Victorian industrialist, art collector and provost of Broughty Ferry. Whaling paintings previously on display are now in The McManus Gallery, Dundee.

The museum also has a small café, shop and meeting place. Castle Green is also very popular, as is the adjacent harbour. The castle has also proved a popular draw on 'Doors Open Days', when normally inaccessible areas (eg, the underground magazines), are opened.

Broughty Castle is also very significant as one of the few intact buildings in public ownership which conforms to the classic image of a medieval Scottish castle with a dominant tower and subordinate courtyard. As such, although its current form is the result of Victorian restoration, it has a certain demonstrative and educational importance, and also has potential as a filming location, one use was to appear as a background landmark in *Bob Servant* on BBC Scotland. Drone footage appears in the BBC Four documentary from 2022, 'The River: A Year in the Life of the Tay.'

Perhaps surprisingly, Broughty Castle functions more as a modern landmark than a memorial of its own past. A fuller understanding of its complex historic role might enable this aspect of its potential to be more fully developed. Similarly, although Broughty Castle appears to have no obvious spiritual associations or uses, a fuller understanding of its role in the Reformation period (Section 2.3) might add to its modern religious profile, and there is also the usual potential for wedding parties, etc.

Broughty Castle, by dint of its variety of uses, seems to maintain a high level of social significance for the local community. As a largely complete and roofed property with strong local connections, Broughty Castle offers plentiful opportunities for education and interpretation, local community involvement and partnership working with the local authority.

3 Major gaps in understanding

- What was on the rock of Broughty, if anything, prior to the 15th-century?
- Who built the castle, the Earls of Angus or the Lords Gray?
- How much was it intended as a lordly residence, and how much was it principally a defensive strongpoint?
- What detailed form did the medieval castle take? The discovery of Robert Rowand Anderson's working drawings would certainly throw light on the nature of the main tower.
- Further geophysical/ground radar survey or excavation would probably reveal important remains and information from:
 - remains of the 1860-1889 phase of the castle;
 - remains of the post 1889 arrangements within the castle;
 - structural remains of the Submarine Mining establishment;
- Atkinson has set out a number of archival sources and secondary accounts which remains to be explored. The preparation of this Statement of Significance has identified further likely sources of information on the defence of the Tay in its wider context.

4 Associated properties

(other related sites locally) - **Affleck Castle**; Balgillo Fort (site of); Castle Huntly; **Claypotts Castle**.

(other 1860 coastal defences) - **Blackness Castle; Fort George; Hackness Martello Tower;** Inchkeith Island.

5 Keywords

tower house, artillery, magazine, caponier, Lord Gray, Rowand Anderson, Volunteers, submarine miners, museum

Bibliography

Arbroath Liber.Liber S. Thome de Aberbrothoc, ed. C. Innes and P. Chalmers (2 vols.,Bannatyne Club, Edinburgh 1848-56)

CSP Scot. Calendar of State Papers Relating to Scotland and Mary Queen of Scots, 1457-1603, ed. J. Bain, W. K. Boyd, H.W. Meikle, A.I Cameron, M.S. Guiseppi, and J.D. Mackie (13 vols., HMSO, 1898-1969)

Cumming, G.,*Forfarshire Illustrated* (Dundee, 1853)

Fraser, Sir W., *The Douglas Book* (4 vols., Edinburgh 1885)

RMS. RegistrumMagniSigillii Regnum Scottorum. The Register of the Great Seal, ed. T. Thomson, J. Maitland Thomson, J. Balfour Paul, J. H. Stevenson and W. K. Dickson (11 vols., Edinburgh, 1814-1984)

Merriman, M., *The Rough Wooings: Mary Queen of Scots 1542-1551* (East Linton, 2000)

Mudie, F., Walker, D., MacIvor, I. & Coutts, H.,*Broughty Castle and the Defence of the Tay* (Dundee, 1970)

Robertson, J. with G. Grubb, *Illustrations of the Topography and Antiquities of the Shires of Aberdeen and Banff* (4 vols., Aberdeen, Spalding Club, 1857-69)
Warden, pp.

MacGibbon, D., and Ross, T., *The Castellated and Domestic Architecture of Scotland* (5 vols., Edinburgh, 1887-1892)

Taylor, S., and Márkus, G.,*The Place-Names of Fife* (5 vols.,Donnington 2006-2012)

Warden, A.J.,*Angus or Forfarshire, the Land and People, Descriptive and Historical* (5 vols., Dundee 1880-1885)

Appendices

Appendix 1:

c. 1180 - The Earl of Angus grants land “at Portincrag” to Arbroath Abbey to establish a hospice for travellers using the ferry, along with fishing rights “from the Crag” westwards. This is the earliest reference to the rock on which Broughty Castle now stands, and the harbour at its foot. The grant is confirmed in 1199-1200 by his son Earl Gilchrist (*Arbroath Liber*, vol. i., no. 50, pp. 34-35). The Earls of Angus are the leading nobleman in Forfarshire, although the main territory of their lordship is located around Kirriemuir, and they subsequently seem to have retained little of this outlying component west of Dundee, except for Broughty Crag itself.

1371-1406 - Margaret Stewart, Countess of Angus, has a royal grant of “the Crag and fishing of Broughty” and the lands of Ethiebeaton. This grant, known only from a passing reference in a sixteenth-century source, is plausibly associated by Sir William Fraser with her successful bid to have her illegitimate son George Douglas recognised as her heir (since a bastard is certainly his *mother’s* son), and as such, probably indicates that she *retained* Broughty Crag when she passed the bulk of her inheritance to her son Earl George in 1389, rather than obtaining it as a new acquisition (Robertson 1857-69, iv. 729; Fraser 1885, ii. 15). This suggests that Broughty Crag was already regarded as the seat of the Earls of Angus, a status which is explicitly attested in 1455.

1424-1437 - Wishart of Pittarrow is said to have controlled the Crag or at least the fishing rights associated with it, but being forfeited for treason by King James I, his property is transferred to the Earl of Angus.

1455 - King James II gives George Douglas, 4th Earl of Angus permission “to build a castle or fortress... on Broughty Crag... fortifying and surrounding that castle or fortress with walls and ditches, and closing it with iron gates, and strengthening and raising it in height, and in the highest part of the same preparing and ordering defensive ornaments, and making and finishing everything else whatsoever which properly pertains to the construction and completion of a castle or fortress” (Fraser 1885, iii. 81). It is unclear whether this represents simply an *intention* to build a castle, or a retrospective license authorising an existing fortress. The document also describes Broughty Crag as the “capital messuage” of the earldom of Angus, its formal seat of government, a curious assertion that is unlikely to have been a recent invention, as the earls retained little here beyond fishing rights and control of the ferry, the territory of their titular lordship lay around at Kirriemuir and their main stronghold was now **Tantallon Castle** in Lothian. Note that this document is usually misdated to 1454, as it was issued on 20th January, and follows the medieval convention of not changing the year-date until 25th March.

1466 - The Earl of Crawford gains control of the “fortress of Broughty” from King James III, indicating that the site is already fortified (Warden 1880-1885, iii. 52).

1489 - Five heavily armed English vessels are captured off the Fife coast, emphasising the importance of defensive fortifications on the Tay.

1490—The 5th Earl of Angus is stripped of much of his power and King James IV transfers Broughty Crag to Andrew, 2nd Lord Gray, newly appointed as hereditary sheriff of Forfarshire, “with full power to make and raise in height a castle and fortress on the said rock, with gatehouses, iron yetts, mache(o)ling, and drawbridges, and all other fortifications” (*RMS* ii. No. 1959). It is unclear how to reconcile this grant with the earlier references to a castle on Broughty Crag, though in 1514 suggests that a considerable rebuilding did take place at this time. Lord Gray's chief seat was Castle Huntly, and in the sixteenth century his family also had a substantial mansion at Fowlis Easter; it has thus been assumed that Broughty was more of a coastal defence than a secondary residence, but this may overlook its symbolic significance. In the same year three more English warships are forced onto nearby sandbanks.

1496 - The castle's completion is often assigned to this year, based on the evidence of a stone dated 1496 once visible “at the north angle of the tower below the battlement” (Cumming 1843, p. 41). However, the dates blazoned on Scottish castles are not always reliable guides to the actual date of their construction, and in some cases (e.g. Lochore Castle in Fife) they are known to have been added anachronistically in the seventeenth century, meaning that the implications of this inscription remain uncertain.

1514 - A legal document mentions the “new fortress of Broughty”, and its “principal keeper”, Thomas Gray, suggesting that the castle had recently been rebuilt (Cumming 1843, p. 41, Warden 1880-85 iii. 52). (The underlying primary source on which this important reference is based has not yet been located.)

1547-1550 - The castle figures in the War of the Rough Wooing that follows the Scottish defeat at the battle of Pinkie (September 1547). The English commander, Protector Somerset, orders Sir Andrew Dudley to take Broughty Castle. Patrick, 4th Lord Gray, surrenders it without a shot being fired. In November 1547, Regent Arran besieges it with 3,000 men, but despite knocking down part of the tower fails to capture it. Further attempts also fail, until February 1550, when a Franco-Scottish force bombards and takes the newly-built English fort on Balgillo Hill, 800m north of Broughty. The English garrison in the castle surrenders the following day.

1551 - Henry Lovell of Ballumbie is accused of seizing control of the castle and the associated fishing rights (NRS GD121/1/111/27A).

1559 - Members of the pro-English Protestant faction known as the “Congregation” occupy Broughty Castle. Their leaders defend this action with the claim that they acted as patriots to preempt a French conspiracy to occupy the castle and thereby to threaten Dundee and Perth. Given the Congregation's own collaboration with an English military expedition, this may be mere hypocrisy. It is likely that Lord Gray regains control in the 1560s.

1570 - During a civil war between a pro-English faction acting in the name of the infant James VI, and supporters of the exiled Mary, Queen of Scots, it is reported in July, that Sir William Kirkaldy of Grange and Mr. James Balfour of Pittendreich, recent defectors to the Queen's party, had begun to fortify Broughty for the Queen, but then abandoned the project (a striking allegation, suggesting that they had considered abandoning the symbolic strength of Edinburgh Castle in favour of Broughty, more easily supported from the sea). In August, the Regent Lennox, head of the pro-English party, assures England that he has taken control of the castle (CSP Scot iii. Nos. 386, 426, pp. 285, 321).

1571 - In September, the Regent Mar, new head of the pro-English faction in the ongoing Scottish civil war, expects to obtain two "battering pieces" from "BurtyCrage", probably bronze cannons of relatively large calibre, to assist in his planned siege of Edinburgh (CSP Scot iii. No. 956, p. 707). However, the castle is seized by David Seaton, laird of Parbroath, on behalf of the opposition faction loyal to the exiled Mary Queen of Scots (*Diurnal*, p. 255). Lord Gray resumes control, but in April 1572, he makes his peace with the pro-English regency; he continues to play a complex role - culturally, he is francophile and undisguisedly Catholic, but he also serves as an intelligence asset of the English regime, which is staunchly Protestant and anti-French.

1589 - Patrick, Master of Gray (later 6th Lord Gray), is said to be sheltering the fugitive Earl of Bothwell and the Jesuits William Crichton, Robert Hay and Robert Bruce in the castle (CSP Scot vol x, No. 294, p. 202).

1594 - The Master of Gray sells "the salmon fishing of Broughty, with two round towers in the palace of Broughty, and the building for the fishery called the vault fish house for the preparation and curing of the fish", to a Dundee burgess, Robert Flescher, for £2,000 Scots (around £170 sterling); in 1601, Flescher obtains a charter from King James VI to confirm his control (RMS vol. vi., No. 1190. p. 414).

1607-1612 - After a troubled period residing at his ancestral seat of Castle Huntly, the Master of Gray is forced to return to Broughty with his wife, Mary Stewart, James VI's cousin. He becomes 6th Lord Gray in 1608, but dies in 1612. His widow, Mary, sells Castle Huntly and continues to reside at Broughty.

1651 - While General Monk, Cromwell's commander in Scotland, is besieging Dundee, an opposing Scottish garrison continues to hold Broughty, but on the night of 31st August they abandon the castle, leaving behind four cannons, a single barrel of gunpowder, and nineteen barrels of salmon. These are described as "provisions" by an English source, but are probably from the fishery (Firth 1895, p. 10). Dundee is captured by assault the next day. The defeated Scottish junta, the "Committee of Estates", had been captured at Alyth a few days previously, and they are said to have been conveyed to England via Broughty, but it is unclear if they are lodged in the castle after its

capture, or simply ferried out past it to waiting English warships. It does not seem that Monck's army leaves a permanent garrison in Broughty during the military government of the 1650s.

1663 - Andrew, 7th Lord Gray, dies. In 1666, Patrick, 8th Lord Gray, struggling with debts, sells Broughty to David Fotheringham of Powrie, near Dundee. The Fotheringhams have little interest in Broughty other than its fishing rights.

1715 - During the 1715 uprising, the Jacobites gain control of Dundee, and appear to install a garrison in Broughty Castle, suggesting that it is still in reasonably good repair. In January 1716, the Old Pretender (King James VIII & III to his Jacobite supporters) formally appoints the burgh grandee Alexander Wedderburn as governor of the fortress (Wedderburn 1898, pp. 256-7).

1787 - Robert Burns visits Broughty and describes it as 'a finely situated ruin jutting into the Tay'.

1801 - General Hunter of Burnside begins to lay out 'the New Town at the north ferry' (now Broughty Ferry).

1821 - The castle is offered for sale in the *Dundee, Perth and Coupar Advertiser* (21 December) as a potentially 'delightful residence' capable of restoration at small expense, or 'which would make an excellent situation for an inn'. There were no takers.

1846 - The castle is purchased by the Edinburgh and Northern Railway to enable construction of the rail ferry harbour.

1850 - The castle is purchased by the Dundee and Arbroath Railway Company, which uses the vaults as storage.

1854 - Soon after the outbreak of the Crimean War, the castle is purchased by the War Office with the intention that it be rearmed to help protect the Tay from Russian warships. The war ends (1856) before anything substantial is done. A medieval gun, the chamber of a sixteenth-century wrought-iron breech-loader is found in the ruined north-east tower in 1856 (Now LH 212 in the National Museum of Scotland collection. cf. Caldwell 1981, p. 543).

1860 - Threat of a French invasion prompts the War Office to carry out its plan. The 26-year old Robert Rowand Anderson is asked to convert the medieval castle into 'a solid piece of modern masonry bristling all over with guns'. The works include reordering and extending the main tower, for use as a magazine and barracks, and building a large angled earthen gun battery to its south and east armed with two 68-pounder guns and five 10-inch guns. Other works include a guardhouse, a caponier (gun gallery) and an enclosure at the south-west corner to provide a hospital as well as cover for the adjacent harbour in case of land attack.

1861 - The new fort is completed. In December a 42-gun salute to mark Prince Albert's death is fired, according to tradition the only occasion Broughty's guns are fired! (This is unlikely to be true as the guns must also have been fired during training).

1862 - A practice battery is set up on Castle Green, to the east of the castle, for use by the Forfarshire Artillery Volunteers (raised 1859), who make Broughty their HQ until they move to Dundee in 1870.

1864 - Broughty Ferry becomes a burgh.

post 1870 - The castle is used as a military school.

1882 - A shore battery is built at Buddon Ness, on the coast 5 miles east of Broughty Ferry.

1887 - In December 1887 the Royal Artillery and Royal Engineers Works Committee described the defences of the Tay:
'Broughty Castle is at present the only work of defence for the River Tay. The existing work is an obsolete work crowded with S.B. [smooth bore] guns. In its present condition it is worse than useless.'²

1888 - The castle again becomes a garrison HQ, this time for the newly-formed Tay Division Submarine Miners Royal Engineers (Volunteers), whose task is to lay mines in the Tay in an emergency. A new building (still in use) is erected outside the castle to serve as their accommodation.

1889-91—Broughty's armament is radically overhauled to implement the recommendations made by the Stanhope Committee of 1887 based on a list of shortcomings by the Joint Committee of the Royal Artillery and Royal Engineers. Works include building two new barbettes with concrete aprons, thus burying Anderson's emplacements. The south-west enclosure is filled in. New, more effective, guns come and go during the 1890s.

1903-5 - With Germany replacing France as the chief threat, another gun battery, armed with long-range guns, is installed on Castle Green. The battery was provided with two Defence Electric Lights. Both were moveable concentrated beams, No. 1 being just to the right flank of the battery; No. 2 200 yards to the left flank.

1913 - Broughty Ferry is incorporated into the City of Dundee.

1914 - At the start of WWI, minor works are carried out to improve the defensive capability of the fort.

1932 - The castle is completely disarmed. The last of its garrison leaves in 1934.

² CAB 18/22A

1935 - The castle is transferred from the War Department to the Ministry of Works.

1939 - The castle is returned to the War Department, re-armed and re-garrisoned, this time by 503 Coast Regiment Royal Artillery. In 1942, a defence post is built on the top of the tower.

1945 - The castle is returned to the Ministry of Works.

1949 – The castle is leased to Dundee Corporation for use as a tea-room.

1969 - Dundee Corporation opens a museum in the tower. Today, the tower houses exhibitions and remains open all year round.

1989 - Three rare Armstrong guns, dating from the 1860s, are discovered on Broughty Ferry pier serving as bollards. They are reclaimed, conserved and put on display in the castle grounds.